

The Committee of 100

on the Federal City



June 10, 2020

Melissa Chiu, Director

chium@si.edu

Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden

Independence Avenue & 7th Street, SW

Washington, DC 20560

Founded 1923

Chair

Kirby Vining

Vice-Chair

Alma Gates

Secretary

Erik Hein

Treasurer

George R. Clark

Trustees

Charlie Bien

Larry Hargrove

Naima Jefferson

Aidan Jones

Nancy MacWood

Meg Maguire

David Marlin

Sheldon Repp

Andrea Rosen

Marilyn Simon

Jim Smailes

Pat Tiller

James Wilcox

Evelyn Wrin

Stephen Hansen, Emeritus

RE:Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden Restoration and Rehabilitation Proposal

Director Chiu:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the current proposal to restore/ rehabilitate the Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden – one of our nation’s historically significant, mid-20th century monumental structures and urban landscapes. We comment as a Consulting Party under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (54 USC §300101 et seq).

Founded in 1923, **The Committee of 100 on the Federal City** is Washington, DC’s oldest, independent, citizen planning advocacy organization. Our mission is to sustain and safeguard the physical values that give our Nation’s Capital its distinction, beauty and rich community character. As such, we advocate for sound land-use planning, affordable housing, exceptional design, responsible zoning, effective transportation planning, heritage preservation, and parks, open space, and environmental conservation.

Throughout this current consultation process, we have been heartened by what appears to be the thoughtful and high-quality proposals for treatment of the exterior of the Hirshhorn Museum itself. The careful recreation of the “drum” exterior masonry replacement panels and deftly-handled thermal/insulation retrofit are particularly praiseworthy. Notable also is the plan to restore and “reimagine” the now-closed access tunnel under Jefferson Drive between the north side of the Fountain Plaza and the Sculpture Garden – restoring one of architect Gordon Bunshaft’s signature Hirshhorn concepts.

The Sculpture Garden is, however, the more complex challenge. Described by many as a palimpsest, it reflects the handiwork of two 20th century American masters – architect Gordon Bunshaft and landscape architect Lester Collins (among others). We were pleased with the decision to advance the proposed period of historic significance of the Sculpture Garden to 1974/1981 (*Period of Significance and Integrity Report*) to include Collins’ important contribution. In so doing, you recognize his rightful place in the history of American landscape design.

945 G Street, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20001

202.681.0225

www.committeeof100.net

info@committeeof100.net

A beautiful and livable Washington, DC for all.

Many aspects of the current Sculpture Garden proposal are sound including: restoration/recreation of the badly-damaged perimeter, shuttered aggregate retaining walls, better opening the garden to the north (Mall) side, proposed new plant material plan, exterior lighting, and sensitive upgrading of ramps, steps, and balustrades for code conformance – particularly the Americans with Disabilities Act. Also noteworthy are wholly new concepts in re-ordering the general “floorplan” of garden space into three general areas in anticipation of new uses and a lively and publicly-inviting Sculpture Garden.

Having said this, we hope to convince you to reconsider two problematic choices being proposed - one an issue of subtraction, the other of addition.

Bunshaft Reflecting Pool: The proposal to eliminate and render meaningless the historic, black Bunshaft-designed reflecting pool is, to our thinking, the loss of a critically-important historic design element. The pool harkens to the Garden’s earliest iteration and is, arguably, the most significant garden palimpsest surviving. The synchronicity or interplay between the pool and the large “slit” window on the north face of the museum drum is unmistakable. It joins them together. They are on axis, one a reflection of the other - a ying and yang, if you will. The interplay was (and remains) intentional. There is no doubt what Bunshaft was about. So much so that Lester Collins (recognizing this at the time) resisted Smithsonian efforts to remove it in his remaking of the Garden in the late 1970’s/80’s. The current proposal offers what is at best a “weak” nod to the historic feature – effectively burying it as a “gesture” within the larger proposed new water feature. The Bunshaft Reflecting Pool should remain (and prominently) to function as designed. A new design solution for this prominent new central area balancing better new needs (such as removable performance stage) while preserving the historic integrity of the pool is surely not beyond the talents of the current design team. Such a removable stage could easily be mounted over the existing historic pool.

New Stacked Stone Partition Walls: The proposed introduction of rough-hewn, granite, dry-laid stone partition walls would radically contradict the overall historic aesthetic of the Hirshhorn complex and is wholly inconsistent with the Sculpture Garden’s historic character. Were it executed, it would constitute an Adverse Effect. The very sparseness of the shuttered concrete walls throughout the garden was likewise – intentional, to both Bunshaft and to Collins, as the background better to feature rather than compete with the more important sculpture. Shuttered concrete must likewise be the material choice for replacing the deteriorated partition walls. This material is the unmistakable hallmark of the Brutalist architectural style of which the Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden is so prominent an American example. We strongly urge your reconsideration of this proposal.

Thank you again for the opportunity to provide the Committee of 100’s comments on this important and wholly compelling project. If we may provide clarification or answer any questions, please contact us. We appreciate your consideration of our views.

Sincerely,



Kirby Vining, Chair

- cc:
- Jaya Kaveeshwar, Deputy Director, Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden,
kaveeshwarj@si.edu
 - Carly Bond, Historic Preservation Specialist, Smithsonian Facilities Office of Planning,
Design, & Construction bondc@si.edu
 - Sharon C. Park, Smithsonian Associate Director of Architectural History and
Historic Preservation parks@si.edu
 - Charles A. Birnbaum, Founder + President, The Cultural Landscape Foundation
charles@tclf.org
 - C. Andrew Lewis, Senior Historic Preservation Officer, DC State Historic Preservation
Office Andrew.Lewis@dc.gov
 - David Maloney, DC State Historic Preservation Officer David.Maloney@dc.gov
 - Thomas Luebke, Secretary, Commission of Fine Arts tluebke@cfa.gov
 - Marcel Acosta, Executive Director, National Capital Planning Commission,
marcel.acosta@ncpc.gov
 - Lee Webb, National Capital Planning Commission, Lee.webb@ncpc.gov
 - Elizabeth Merritt, National Trust for Historic Preservation emerritt@savingplaces.org
 - Rebecca Miller, DC Preservation League Rebecca@dcpreservation.org
 - Peggy McGlone, Washington Post peggy.mcglone@washpost.com
 - Philip Kennicott, Washington Post philip.kennicott@washpost.com
 - William Brown, AOI aoiofdc@gmail.com
 - John Fowler, ACHP jfowler@achp.gov
 - Marnique Heath, Chair, DC Historic Preservation Review Board
historic.preservation@dc.gov